

June 5, 2012

7:00 p.m.

Planning Division
Council Chambers

MEMBERS PRESENT: Commissioners Doug Branson, Jake Cordova, Donna Cosgrove, David Hodder, George Morrison, Leslie Polson, George Swaney, Dee Whittier, and Margaret Wimborne.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Commissioners Natalie Black, Brent Dixon, and Kurt Karst.

ALSO PRESENT: Planning Director Renée Magee, Assistant Director Brad Cramer, Parks and Recreation Director Greg Wetzel, Recording Secretary Debra Petty, and Dustin Hislop, Design West Architects.

CALL TO ORDER: Chair Wimborne called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m. and reviewed the hearing procedures for the public.

MINUTES: May 1, 2012 Commissioner Polson moved to approve the minutes of May 1, 2012, as presented. Motion seconded by Commissioner Morrison. Aye: 9, Nay: 0, Abstain: 0.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

Wimborne is employed by School District 91 and recused herself from the hearing for a conditional use permit to reconstruct Ethel Boyes Elementary School. Wimborne asked Cosgrove to chair the public hearing.

Conditional Use Permit for the Reconstruction of the Ethel Boyes Elementary School:

Cramer reviewed the staff report, a part of the record. The new school will be constructed west of the existing building and setback 380 feet from Brentwood Drive. There are two shared access points for student drop-off and parking. There is a 180 foot separation between access points with the west access aligning with Call Avenue. This meets the *Access Management Plan*. The plan is designed with sidewalks on each side of the parking and drop-off areas as recommended by the Bonneville Metropolitan Planning Organization *School Traffic Guidelines*. Bus drop-off for the school is to the south at Eagle Rock Junior High. The sidewalk between Brentwood and Eagle Rock will be reconstructed and a portion will be used for emergency access. The Fire Department approved the placement of bollards on the sidewalk to prevent through traffic. Staff is requesting a new photometric plan.

Cosgrove asked for clarification on district policy for lighting during evenings and after school events. Staff deferred the question to the district representative. Cordova is appreciative the *School Traffic Guidelines* were considered in the design of the site.

Cosgrove opened the hearing to public comment.

Dustin Hislop, Design West Architects, 255 S. 300 W., Logan, Utah. Hislop said storm water retention for the site is incorporated in the recreation field. Parking lots have interior landscaping. The lighting plan calls for induction lighting. Commissioner Hodder explained he understands liability impacts lighting plans, but he is opposed to the use of induction light. It is a very bright light and quite reflective. He believes the lighting should be consistent with the high-pressure sodium used throughout the neighborhood, which is a less obtrusive lighting. Polson confirmed the school is ADA compliant.

Margaret Wimborne, 690 John Adams Parkway, Idaho Falls. Wimborne is employed by District 91 and stated the school is designed with an elevator for ADA compliance. She is not familiar with district policy regarding after-hour lighting but will check into the issue. She noted the siting of the new schools prevents them from being landlocked as in the past. Safety has been greatly improved with student drop-off and parking design. Cosgrove noted Hawthorne Elementary has on-site lighting restricted to one hour after events.

Cosgrove closed the hearing to public comment.

Hodder expressed his reluctance in placing a restriction on hours of lighting. He said a new lighting plan will be submitted to staff by the applicant, and he believes the plan should include the use of high-pressure sodium. Cosgrove expressed concern the relocation of the bus drop-off to the south at Eagle Rock Junior High will impact at least two properties to the south.

Cosgrove opened the hearing to public comment.

Margaret Wimborne, 690 John Adams Parkway, Idaho Falls. Wimborne said parking lot lighting is on during school functions. There will be a dozen at most. The wall mounted lighting is concentrated near entrances to the building and is shielded downward. Branson said there are only one to two homes impacted by the lighting of the school.

Cosgrove closed the hearing to public comment. Cordova believes the revised photometric plan should be left to staff for approval. Cramer said lighting at the property line is acceptable at 0.5 foot candles.

Cordova moved to approve the conditional use permit for the reconstruction of Ethel Boyes Elementary School with the conditions a new photometric plan be approved by staff, lighting be limited to 0.5 foot candles at the property line, and bollards be placed 160 feet south of the parking lot. Motion seconded by Morrison. Motion passed. Aye: 8, Nay: 1, Abstain: 0. Hodder said he voted “no” due to the use of induction lighting. It does not match the lighting in the neighborhood, and approval should not be based on the number of homes the lighting may impact. Polson asked Wimborne to follow through with the question regarding district policy on after hours lighting and have a discussion regarding the type of lighting proposed. Cordova believes neighbors adjacent to a school are used to the lighting and this is not a new use. Cosgrove believes Hodder makes a valid point as it is a bright white light and the area

does get a lot of snow. Magee appreciates the comments of Hodder. She said it is difficult to stand at a property line with a light meter at 9:30 p.m. and tell a homeowner the 0.4 foot candles at the property line meets the ordinance when the glare from the light is making her eyes water. Until you have lived next to white lights, the issue is difficult to understand.

BUSINESS: Comprehensive Plan. Wimborne returned to the meeting as a Commissioner. The Commission discussed elements of and process for updating the comprehensive plan. The Commission members also participated in exercises on issues which may be included in the plan.

The meeting adjourned at 8:15 p.m.

Debra Petty, Recording Secretary